

Overview and Scrutiny Committee Meeting – 6 November 2023

Call-In of Decision -KD5579 List No: 25/23-24 (published on 13/10/23): Digital Services EUC (End User Computing)

Call-In Lead: Councilor Chris Dey

Reasons for the “Call in” are detailed below:

Officer Response:

Rationale for EUC & SMD Programme

Our device estate is aged with the majority currently out of warranty including all our Mobile devices.

The deployment of the devices will be in order of prioritisation through age of device and/or defined by specific role requirements e.g. frontline Adult and Children’s Social Care.

The programme also recognises the financial challenges that the Council now faces and will deliver device volumes equating to the approved financial funds for the FY2023/24 £2.83m (detail is set out in KD5579). Future investment in this programme will not be undertaken unless approval to invest has been secured appropriately.

In preparing a programme with the correct scope and therefore the ability to secure investment approval a number of background activities were required, these included:

- Assessment of volumes of devices (Laptop, Mobile Phone and Tablet) managed/maintained, what is the asset management position
- Distribution of devices across the Council, who had what device, by individual, service, department
- Age of device and warranty position associated with the device
- Volumes of incident received through the service desk and the length of maintenance period associated with the device(s)
- What was the security profile for the device estate and impact on the Public Service Network (PSN) compliance

These background activities defined what was needed holistically to address an aged device estate, composing of a multitude of device types, sitting on a security and management platform that was considered to be vulnerable and an access point for undesirable individuals to access our network and all the systems sitting within the network.

It was ascertained that:

- Incident levels are very high based on a 12 month period July 22-23 recording 3,291 incidents across all devices e.g. 604 associated with X270 Laptop, 311 associated with Surface Pro and 185 associated with X390.
- The security profile for all our devices and the management platforms they sit on have a high number of concerns that need to be addressed to support our Public Service Network accreditation, this is a mandatory requirement. This includes the rebuild of the Active Directory to ensure that it is a harden state to prevent hacking of individuals data, operating system is built to best industry standard to address potential of hacking.

All of this would be addressed through the award of a contract to a partner through the Crown Commercial Services Framework EA21 for laptops and Link3 for the Smart Mobile Devices and Managed Service.

Laptops

- High volume (73%) are out of warranty with additional 11% laptops out of warranty over the next 12 months.
- Current technical build/configuration on laptops will be rebuilt and delivered to industry standard on windows 11, this will dramatically reduce current maintenance overhead from DS staff, note windows 12 is released next year which will mean our estate is 2 builds behind.
- High level of support/maintenance/repair overhead and costs is being addressed, e.g. Surface Pro screen £525 without labour.

Approach & Benefits

- Security platform being rebuilt, Active Directory (AD), Mobile Device Management (MDM), to address security issues.
- Replaced in priority order based on age and warranty status and to address security issues e.g. patching issues within the age of the device.
- The volume of model types (35) being reduced (3) to support consistent knowledge of devices on the technical estate.

Mobile Phones & Tablets

- The volume of model types (65) being reduced (3) to support consistent knowledge of devices on the technical estate.
- Mobile devices only have standard manufacturers single year warranty.
- High proportion of Mobile phones and tablets are older than 3 years (66%) with 55% of these older than 4 years.
- Configuration on mobile devices to be rebuilt and delivered via new MDM to secure industry standard.

Approach & Benefits

- Shutting the door on security holes, completing the transfer of SIMs from BTEE to Gamma network Services.
- With predefined profiles aligned with job roles, detailed App functionality delivered OTA via MDM secure control.

Reason for call-in

The decision fails to list the age of the equipment that apparently needs replacing

Officer response

The following provides an overview of the age of devices based on warranty schedule of laptop/mobile and tablet assets for our total devices. Please note that 73% of devices are out of warranty or have no warranty and a further 11% of devices will expire in 2024.

KD5579 recommendation is for £2.83m which covers the replacement of the *oldest* laptops and devices that are resulting in the greatest number of incidents logged/oldest windows version/least secure.

As part of this process in setting the laptop replacement programme, the total devices were allocated into four “tranches” for replacement and then prioritised (see question below for the detail). The two oldest tranches of laptops/devices are covered by the £2.83m.

The replacement of the remaining estate will be considered subject to affordability and impact on service delivery at a future date. Until that time, the remaining laptop estate will primarily be maintained on break and replace approach as they will be beyond economical repair.

Laptops

Total Laptops held	- 4,135
Laptops older than 4 years	- 3,023
Laptops out of warranty in year 2024	- 477
Remining laptops that will remain in warranty post year 2024	- 635

Mobile Phone and Tablets

Total devices	- 3,816
Devices out of warranty devices	- 3,816
All devices are older than 2 years less than 3 years	- 1,151
Devices older than 3 years less than 4 years	- 1,198
Devices older than 4+ years	- 1,467

Reason for call-in

The report does not mention the make/models of equipment being purchased or per unit costs.

Officer response

The unit prices have been derived from the Crown Commercial Services (CCS) framework EA 21 contract and LINK3 framework. Through these frameworks the Council is able to maximise on the buying power from a framework which supports all public bodies procuring devices and services. The council in procuring from these frameworks are not purchasing devices and services in isolation supporting the Value for Money (VfM) required when spending public money.

The two tables below set out the planned devices that are required following an assessment undertaken of service need. Note that KD5579 limits expenditure to £2.83m which covers the oldest devices in phase 1 and 3 for laptops and all phases for mobile phones and tablets.

Within the laptop procurement the Council is receiving as standard (at no additional cost) premier support which includes for example battery replacement and screen replacement. The cost of the laptop (inclusive of premier support) ranges from £1,136 to £1,454. The Yoga (for social workers) range £1,386 - £1,686 (inclusive of premier support). The mobiles cost range from £454 to £1,031.

Phase	Lenovo TPad P16v i7 32GB 512GBSSD	Lenovo TPad X13 i7 16GB 512SSD	Lenovo TPad X13 i7 32GB 512SSD	Lenovo TPad X13 i7 Yoga Touch 16GB 512SSD	Lenovo TPad X13 i7 Yoga Touch 32GB 512SSD	None Withdraw from Service (EUC)	Replacement TBC	Grand Total
POC	3	5	1	2				11
Pilot		6		6				12
1	5	273	43	11		392	10	734
2	2	1223		3		184	17	1429
3	13	13	111	518	1	78	17	751
4	5	901	15	182	16	39	36	1194
Grand Total	28	2421	170	722	17	693	80	4131

SMD's (Phones & Tablets)	Samsung XCover Pro 6	Samsung Tab Active Pro 4	Samsung S23 Ultra	Replacement TBC	Reimage on Samsung Knox MDM	None Withdraw from Service (SMD)	Grand Total
POC	10	10	20				40
Pilot	15	17					32
1	628	64		23		276	991
2	684	255	60	88	721	945	2753
Grand Total	1337	346	80	111	721	1221	3816

Reason for call-in

No mention is given on how many laptops and mobile phones will be purchased.

Officer response

As set out above, the programme aims to replace the oldest devices and all the mobile devices. It is anticipated whilst remaining within the approved investment funds for this programme of £2.83m, of which £1.9m is allocated to the procurement of the devices, the volume of devices will range from:

Laptops: 1000 – 1500 units

Mobile Phones: 700 – 2400 units

Tablets: 90 - 255 units

All devices are within an agreed catalogue. These devices have been defined to support device type against job role.

This programme has undertaken an assessment of needs of each Directorate, and the needs of the devices for the roles in collaboration with service leads in the relevant departments.

Reason for call-in

Lack of assessment regarding workload to IT staff for rolling out new equipment.

Officer response

The roll out of the new equipment is primarily being taken by our partner, the cost of this is included within the £2.83m set out in the KD5579.

The cost of the Council's Digital Team programme management including the requirement gathering, and deployment is included within the financial envelope set out in the report – "Resource Cost £250,680" (as set out in the report).

Although a reduction in the number of incidents reported to the Service Desk is anticipated as a result of the new devices being issued, this benefit will dissipate as time passes and the number of incidents related to the aged remaining devices (which have not been replaced) rise. Therefore, at this stage no savings have been included from Service Desk support costs.

Reason for call-in

Question as to why the Council has not addressed training need of staff to manage reconfiguration of mobile software.

Officer response

The training of staff was a consideration within the planning of this programme. The training requirements of current staff were balanced against the changes that were being delivered with this programme.

These changes across the board; the device itself and the security and Mobile Device Management (MDM) systems requires a change in the operating model and the support skills that are not within the current team.

To upskill the staff will require a lengthy period which does not support the current timelines of deployment to secure efficiencies and improvements in our incident levels.

Using our partners provide a resource support pool that have extensive experience of the devices being deployed, best industry practice approaches to configuring our new devices, via cloud based (new) Active Directory (AD) and the MDM System against individual job role profiles.

- This approach supports:
 - Configuration Over The Air (OTA)
 - Base configuration is standard and applications within this core build supports the majority of role requirements for eligible mobile users
 - Job Role Profiles will provide the specific application set that is required for individuals in a specific service. If the individual then moves service areas, Active Directory picks up this change synchronises with the MDM profile and the users SMD will be automatically updated to reflect that change without the need for the user to return to base to effect the change
 - Updates and rebuilds will be quicker as they can be done / managed remotely OTA
 - Security engaged over the air will be quicker to either “Stun” the device temporarily or “Brick” the device to hand over to blue light services to address any criminal activity
 - Efficiency savings immediately from security, service maintenance (ongoing) and on new Airtime usage contract with Gamma

Reason for call-in
Report lacks detail around the issue of SIM contracts 'needs to be brought under control'
Officer response
<p>Since 2020, and the inception of Covid-19 and move to home working, the number of SIMS increased across the Council. Based on current working practices a review of our data requirements for hybrid working longer term was undertaken and this has resulted in a change in our contract from individual SIMS to a single data and voice contract for the whole of the Council. This has facilitated a review of the requirements of the organization to reflect our modern council.</p> <p>The Mobile Voice and Data – SIM Airtime Contract was awarded in June 2023. This was a 2+1+1 year contract to Gamma Network Solutions Limited (GNSL) under CCS Framework Lot 1 of RM6261.</p> <p>The project team have used specialised industry experience to challenge all services currently being supported, and to get the business to review their requirements. In addition, the supplier is to use its' expertise to confirm and manage the administration for the reduction of SIMs in use, transfer all to a co-terminus shared airtime agreement, and therefore the council only pays for what is being used.</p> <p>In summary:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1,827 SIM have been cancelled with a further portion being targeted for cancellation through collaboration with Directorates to optimize SIM requirements within the Council. This exercise will confirm actual need for SIM and associated device for role. • Laptops will not have SIMs, optimise ways of working, tethering off mobile phone, primary profile of single SIM per mobile user.

Reason for call-in
No cost assessment is provided on option of continuing with IT products that are out of warranty.
Officer response
<p>In considering the devices programme an assessment of the options included the following information:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • An assessment was undertaken based on a snapshot of incidents for devices over a 12-month period Jul 22-23 – 3,291 incidents recorded.

- 50% of MS Surface Pros had incidents, these are the most expensive and resource intense repair device, example £520+ cost for every screen that needs to be replaced, smoldering screens (from batteries) and other components not unusual and have been witnessed within the repair environment of DS and with frontline service staff.
- Laptops are currently beyond economical repair and without new laptops old laptops are cannibalised to support the rebuild at component level to secure a working laptop. This does not guarantee a working laptop at the end because of the age and damage that may occur during repurposing components from one laptop to another.
- An average phone issue takes between 30 mins and 24 hours to remediate a problem with a phone.

Reason for call-in

Report does not detail the tendering process.

Officer response

- The tender process was completed in 2021 through Crown Commercial Services (CCS) framework which aligned with EA21.
- Link3 framework is being used to manage the second contract in respect of Smart Mobile Devices. This contract and framework has been approved as required based on the link in work and impact on the successful delivery of the programme and subsequent management of the smart mobile device operational service.
- Digital Services have worked in collaboration with the procurement lead.

Reason for call-in

Financing this project means £3.2m being added to the MRP & debt interest. The report does not set out what cuts to residents' services will be required to fund this decision. Year one alone will have an impact of £803k

Officer response

The original capital budget of £2.8m was approved as part of the £55m Digital Services ten-year capital programme in January 2023 and the interest and MRP attributable to the programme were included in the medium term financial plan and will be addressed as part of this annual process.

The change in the economic environment and increase in interest rates has led to a

refresh of the Council's Capital Strategy which will be set out in the November 2023 Cabinet report – "2024/25-2033/34 Capital Strategy". As part of this refresh, a review of all capital projects has been undertaken, including the original digital services investment programme. The replacement of the *oldest* devices was considered a priority project given the issues experienced with as set out above.

As part of the roll out of these devices refresh programme, it is expected that the updated configuration and security will translate to operational efficiencies in front line delivery of Council services from Street Works to Child and Adult Social Care services to Emergency Planning Operations – the hard evidence for this will only come once the devices are deployed within business areas to provide these benefits.

Proposal: Councillor Dey has asked that the decision is referred back to the decision maker.